

Code of Practice feedback and initial responses for discussion 29/12/2020 中文在第二个表格中

	Comment	Preliminary response	Comments
O1	Mandatory sections: We observed that most of mandatory requirements are qualitative, with only one (out of 24) being quantified. Does your "Welfare Code of Practice Assessment Guide" provides figures or additional clues to assess these qualitative requirements?	Conformity with all criteria can be assessed using direct or proxy indicators. These indicators and their assessment method will be clearly stated in the assessor's manual	
O2	General: We understand that to reach Silver level, 50% of good practices are to be met, but with no indications on which ones. Aren't there criteria more important than others? Again, maybe your "Welfare Code of Practice Assessment Guide" provides guidance or advice on that point?	Different farms have different potentials to improve against different criteria on shorter and longer timescales. Therefore, the CoP does not distinguish between the improvement indicators. Achieving 50% of any of them is sufficient for Silver level.	
O3	General: Is there an expectation to progress from Bronze to Silver under a minimum period (1 or 2 year for example)?	Section 3 added this requirement: "After each farm's first successful accreditation event, each farm is expected to improve on at least one improvement indicator each year until Gold status is achieved"	
O4	2.2.8 We were surprised not to find a criterion requiring a continuous access to an outdoor area. Is it because most of farming systems are fully indoor farming? Couldn't it be put as a good practice? Or is it included in what you mentioned as "exercise area"?	We have clarified this by adding the word "outdoor" in 2.2.8.	
O5	Sections 2.6 and 2.7: We found the slaughter and transport sections to be lighter than the other ones, with not so many quantified requirements, whether compulsory or not. Is it because it rarely happens on farm, and therefore is out of scope of this document? These two issues are quite sensitive in terms of animal welfare, and we imagined more criterion to secure these practices (examples for	Transport and slaughter off-farm are not addressed by the CoP because the CoP is used for farm accreditation, not for accreditation of transporters or slaughterhouses. The transport section is restricted to transport during farm transfer or transport for other purposes under the control of	

	Comment	Preliminary response	Comments
	transport: a maximum travel distance or time? Shelter from the sun? Slope and floor of the truck? Example for slaughter: restrictions on authorized methods?).	the herder/farm manager. The main risks with this type of transport have been addressed. On-farm slaughter is an area of concern and will be an important focus of future programmes that will test, demonstrate and promote humane slaughter methods. At present, there is insufficient basis for determining methods that are practical in the herding context. On-farm wording has been clarified in Introduction, in the list of units in Section 2; and in the note at the start of 2.6 "These requirements apply only to transport for the purpose of transfer between locations on the farm and transport for other purposes under the control of the farm manager"	
O6	General: Environment and land management are not included in this document, and we understand it is focused on animal welfare exclusively. Is it supposed to be covered in future specific Code of Practice?	At present there is insufficient evidence of grassland management practices to recommend in China's cashmere producing regions. It is an aspiration to test and demonstrate financially profitable grassland management practices and to include them in future revisions of the Code of Practice.	
O7	General: Same question for traceability, both in terms of: fibre identification and segregation records / document management (for example harvested fibre quantities, accidental deaths, drugs...).	Traceability will be addressed by the SFA Chain of Custody guidelines, which are currently under development.	
L1	<u>2.1.FEEDING and DRINKING WATER</u> Good practice requirements applicable to all farms ADD – Dietary management should change in relation to physiological state of the animals (Pregnant, Milking, kids)	2.1.1 now reads "Goats must have access to adequate nutrition, suited to each animal's needs and physiological state, unless a restricted diet has been specified by a suitably qualified person."	

	Comment	Preliminary response	Comments
L2	<p>Good practice requirements applicable to all farms ADD</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> – Adequacy of dietary plans should be evaluated using Body Condition Score and consequently modified if needed 	<p>Body condition scoring following a recognized scoring system is not currently widespread practice in Inner Mongolia. Introduction of a BCS scheme and related training could be part of a longer-term capacity building plan.</p>	
L3	<p>Good practice requirements applicable to all farms ADD</p> <p>2.1.13 – Changes in feed administration should be recorded</p>	<p>Literacy levels are low on many small farms and herders have no practice of recording production practices, so requiring this is likely to lead to low compliance with no benefits for animal welfare.</p>	
L4	<p><u>2.2. FARMING ENVIRONMENT – HOUSING BUILDINGS</u></p> <p>Mandatory requirements ADD</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> – In this section indication on how to manage delivery and nursing space must be added – 	<p>At present, specific risks related to the space for managing delivery and nursing have not been identified. We will keep this under review as data from farm auditing come available.</p>	
L5	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> – It should be introduced in this section the need to have two spaces for quarantine and infirmary which should be located far from the other housing environments and properly managed 	<p>At present, lack of these two functional spaces has not been identified as a common welfare risk, as maintaining these two spaces is already common practice. Distance between the two functional spaces is affected by tenure rights beyond the control of the land user, so specific distances have not been specified in the code of practice</p>	
L6	<p>Good practice requirements applicable to all farms ADD</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> – Accommodation and fittings for securing animals shall be constructed and maintained so that there are no sharp edges or protrusions likely to cause injury to the animals. – 	<p>This is included in the existing requirement 2.2.1.</p>	
L7	<p>2.2.12 add: ...and to prevent attack from wild carnivorous animals</p>	<p>2.2.12 has added the wording “and to prevent attack from predators”</p>	

	Comment	Preliminary response	Comments
L8	2.2.14 2.2.15 please provide text of the cited standards NY/T 682 and NY/T 1168	The text of these standards will be translated and made available as supplementary material	
L9	<p>Good practice requirements applicable to all farms ADD</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> – in each farm, different buildings should be clearly identified. Requirement for building devoted to fiber harvesting and feeding storage will be analysed in dedicated section of the document. – 	It is not clear what “clearly identified” means. If it means identified with a permanent plaque, this is unnecessary as all people on the farm know which building is which and lack of a plaque does not itself impede animal welfare. If it means “identified to the auditor during an audit visit” then this does not need to be written into the code of practice.	
L10	<p>Good practice requirements applicable to all farms ADD</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> – Adequate facilities for the storage of raw materials for the diet must be identified and placed far from housing environment to avoid contamination at unloading of feedstuffs. 	The current requirement applicable to all farms is 2.1.2, which relates to the risk of feeding contaminated feed. At this stage, it would not be productive to impose farm infrastructure investment requirements on producers. However, we will continually review the related risks. For farms run by enterprises, this requirement is reflected in the biosafety measures of the related standards.	
L11	<p>Good practice requirements applicable to all farms ADD</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> – Structures that can accommodate work vehicles should be placed within the farm limits but far from living environments to avoid contaminations due to unclean wheels. 	For farms run by enterprises, this requirement is reflected in the biosafety measures of the related standards. For other producers, at this stage it would not be productive to impose additional farm infrastructure investment requirements. However, we will continually review the related risks.	
L12	<p>Good practice requirements applicable to all farms ADD</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> – When flocks include numerous animals, animals should be allocated in different groups according to age and physiological status, respecting space allowance 	Segregating into sub-groups is already common practice in China’s cashmere producing regions, so we did not add it to the code of practice. Space allowance is addressed in 2.2.5	
L13	<p>Good practice requirements applicable to all farms ADD</p>	Requirement 2.3.4 identifies a broader range of potential reasons for isolating a goat: “when a goat	

	Comment	Preliminary response	Comments
	Goats should never be isolated, except under veterinary prescription for infective disease	first enters a farm; or when they are sick, injured or convalescing; or for other reasons to protect goats' welfare". This broader range of reasons better covers the risks to individual animals' welfare.	
L14	<p><u>2.3. HUSBANDRY MANAGEMENT</u></p> <p>Mandatory requirements ADD</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> – Laparoscopic artificial insemination method is forbidden as well as the Embryo transfer both for reproduction and for ovum pick. 	2.3.9 is now a mandatory criterion and the new criterion 2.3.4 has been changed to "Transcervical and/or intrauterine (laparoscopic) artificial insemination (AI) and embryo transfer are not allowed, and artificial insemination must only be implemented by competent trained personnel."	
L15	<p>Mandatory requirements ADD</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> – 2.3.2 Add...and a health register should be present in each farm – 	Literacy levels are low on many small farms and herders have no practice of recording production practices (except vaccinations, which are filled in by the para-vet), so requiring this is likely to lead to low compliance with no benefits for animal welfare.	
L16	<p>Mandatory requirements ADD</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> – 2.3.4 Quarantine must be far from housing environments 	Distances are affected by tenure rights beyond the control of the land user, so specific distances have not been specified in the code of practice, and adhering to the suggestion may require additional investment which at this stage would not be productive to require.	
L17	<p>Good practice requirements applicable to all farms ADD</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> – If mastitis will occur, milk must not be used to feed kids and must be discarded properly 	Mastitis is one among several conditions that have specific implications for good management practices. It is not possible to specify them all in the CoP, so responses to specific veterinary conditions will be addressed in future training programmes	
L18	<p><u>2.4. HEALTH</u></p> <p>Mandatory requirements ADD</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> – A register with animal health data is strongly advised to have an overview of the health and treatment status of individual and groups of animals. 	Literacy levels are low on many small farms and herders have no practice of recording production practices, so requiring this is likely to lead to low compliance with no effects on animal welfare.	

	Comment	Preliminary response	Comments
L19	<p>Good practice requirements applicable to all farms ADD</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> – 2.4.5 Hoof should be checked at least once a year and – 	2.4.6 now reads "Hoofs should be checked at least once a year and trimmed when necessary to prevent lameness."	
L20	<p>Good practice requirements applicable to all farms ADD</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> – 2.4.5 Add: and a register of the treatment must be available in farm – 	Literacy levels are low on many small farms and herders have no practice of recording production practices, so requiring this is likely to lead to low compliance with no effects on animal welfare.	
L21	<p>Good practice requirements applicable to all farms ADD</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> – 2.4.7 Add: ...and should be registered – 	The requirement to keep vaccination records has been added as this is in line with current legal requirements.	
L22	<p>Good practice requirements applicable to all farms ADD</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> – 2.4.9 A veterinarian responsible for animal health and welfare must be identified and must visit the farm at least twice per year 	Veterinarians in cashmere producing regions currently have no mandate for animal welfare and there is no guidance to instruct them in this. The approach here is to improve the animal welfare knowledge skills and practice of all people with roles in goat husbandry. 2.4.9 is applicable to farms run by enterprises as it is a reasonable expectation that they have a full-time veterinarian to meet goats' health needs. For smallholder farms it is excessive burden to require they pay the costs of veterinarian visits unless for the purpose of preventive or curative actions.	
L23	<p>Additional good practice requirements applicable to farms run by enterprises ADD</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> – 2.4.10 it is CRUCIAL to consult the cited standards because in this document biosafety is totally missing. It results only cited but never described 	The text of these standards will be translated and made available as supplementary material	
L24	<p>Additional good practice requirements applicable to farms run by enterprises ADD</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> – Add: <i>Feral animals/wildlife/weed control</i> 	Minimizing risks from diseases from other domestic animals is addressed in the biosafety requirements of the standards referred to. There is currently no	

	Comment	Preliminary response	Comments
	To minimise the potential for wildlife and domestic or feral animals to introduce diseases to livestock.	evidence on the question of disease transmission from wildlife or feral animals. It could be taken as a topic to investigate for future.	
L25	<p>2.5. FIBRE HARVESTING</p> <p>Good practice requirements applicable to all farms ADD</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> – After clipping, if cold and windy, goats must be housed indoor, kept dry, and properly fed (with good raw materials) for at least 2 - 3 days – 	2.5.8 reads "If the weather becomes cold after fibre harvesting, measures should be taken to avoid goats from suffering from cold." This specifies the outcome without specifying the measures, which is in line with the SFA Standards Setting Procedure.	
L26	<p>Good practice requirements applicable to all farms ADD</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> – the harvest shed area should be physically and visually separate from rest area – 	At this stage, it would not be productive to impose additional infrastructure investment requirements on producers.	
L27	<p>Good practice requirements applicable to all farms ADD</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> – Before harvesting begins, the above hygiene rules must be ensured. All goats must not have access to food and water for at least 12 hours beforehand, and they must be presented for harvesting according to pre-determined categories (age, sex, etc.). 	Presenting goats by cohort is already common practice. The suggestion to add fasting has been added, and the CoP follows the ICCAW Requirements, which were the result of expert consultation.	
L28	<p>Under point 2.5.8 please add the following requirement: "During shearing and combing cashmere fiber should be put in nylon fiber bags to avoid contamination and pollution. Polypropylene bags shouldn't be used."</p>	Bags are often provided by companies and their agents. Improving the material that bags are made from requires cooperation between supply chain actors, so it is not added into these requirements for farm animal welfare, but can be addressed in the future through programmes collaborating with supply chain actors	
L29	<p>2.6. TRANSPORT</p> <p>Mandatory requirements ADD</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> – Male and female, adult and kids must be separate during the transport 	This is already common practice in cashmere producing regions.	

	Comment	Preliminary response	Comments
L30	<p>Good practice requirements applicable to all farms ADD</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> – Need for a properly ventilation during transport – 	Lack of ventilation during transport has not been identified as a risk during transport operated by herders. However, this will be borne in mind during further investigations of transport welfare issues.	
L31	<p>Good practice requirements applicable to all farms ADD</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> – the loading and unloading facilities are adequately designed, constructed, maintained and operated to avoid injury and suffering and ensure the safety of the animals 	The new criterion 2.6.3 has been added: "Vehicles, loading and unloading facilities must be adequately designed, constructed, maintained and operated to avoid injury and suffering and ensure the safety of all goats being transported."	
L32	<p>Good practice requirements applicable to all farms ADD</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> – enough floor area and height is provided for the animals, appropriate to their size and the intended journey; 	This is covered in the existing 2.6.4 which defines floor space requirements and adequate height as being able to stand up.	
L33	<p>Good practice requirements applicable to all farms ADD</p> <p>Special attention should be paid to avoid injuries to animals using secure smooth fittings free from sharp protrusions.</p>	The new criterion 2.6.3 has been added: "Vehicles, loading and unloading facilities must be adequately designed, constructed, maintained and operated to avoid injury and suffering and ensure the safety of all goats being transported."	
L34	<p><u>2.7. Humane slaughter</u></p> <p>Good practice requirements applicable to all farms ADD</p> <p>2.7.4 If used for food, Before slaughter, the relevant regulations on drug withdrawal periods should be strictly adhered to</p>	The wording "If used for food,.. " has been added in 2.7.4	
R1	<p><u>2.1.1</u> Change to: Goats must have access to adequate nutrition, suited to each animal's needs and production state each day, unless a restricted diet has been specified by a suitably qualified person(s).</p>	2.1.1 now reads "Goats must have access to adequate nutrition, suited to each animal's needs and physiological state, unless a restricted diet has been specified by a suitably qualified person."	
R2	<p><u>2.1.2</u> Suggested new standard: Hay nets must not be used for feeding horned goats due to entanglement risk.</p>	Use of hay nets for feeding has not been identified as a risk in cashmere producing areas of China	

	Comment	Preliminary response	Comments
R3	2.1.5 Change to: Goats, including kids , must have daily access to sufficient, clean and fresh drinking water each day, unless required not to, by a suitably qualified person(s) .	2.1.8 now reads "Goats (including kids) must have access to sufficient, clean and fresh drinking water each day, unless required not to, by a suitably qualified person."	
R4	ADD: Suggested new standard: Goats, including kids, should have continuous access to sufficient, clean and fresh drinking water, unless required not to, by a suitably qualified person(s).	This would be aspirational, but is not currently feasible on many farms in the main production areas because of the nature of water sources and distances between grazing locations and farmsteads.	
R5	2.1.6 Include in mandatory requirements	This is mainly a risk in fully housed systems. It has been moved into the mandatory requirements.	
R6	2.1.8 Change to: When feed troughs are used, all goats should be able to eat at the same time, with the following minimum feed space allowances provided: Small goats: 40cm per head Large goats: 50cm per head These requirements are a minimum and should be increased depending on the individual.	It is common practice to feed goats in cohorts, which enables space requirements to be managed by varying animal numbers. As the comment points out, space requirements must consider individual animals. Considering also that it may not be productive to require investments in farm infrastructure, so the revised draft remains consistent with the ICCAW requirements, which do not specify space requirements beyond "goats can eat at the same time without crowding".	
R7	2.1.9 Include in mandatory requirements. Change to: Feeding equipment must be kept clean and maintained, with any damage repaired before animals are allowed to use the equipment .	This has been moved to the mandatory requirements (2.1.3 in the revised requirements)	
R8	2.1.10 Include in mandatory requirements	This requirement applies only to farms with grazing or semi-housing systems, and has been moved to 2.1.1 as a supplementary condition to the main clause in 2.1.1	
R9	2.1.11 Include in mandatory requirements	This requirement has been moved to mandatory requirement 2.1.7	

	Comment	Preliminary response	Comments
R10	ADD Suggested new standard: Goats should be given opportunities to express natural foraging behaviour where they are kept indoors.	The new criterion 2.1.11 has been added: "If a farm uses a housing system, goats should be given opportunities to express natural foraging behaviour (e.g. foraging at different heights and choosing among diverse foods)."	
R11	2.2 ADD Suggested new standard: When housed, there must be a period of low level lighting to promote resting behaviour.	New criterion 2.1.12 reads "If a farm uses a housing system, daily there must be a period of low level lighting to promote resting behaviour."	
R12	Suggested new standard: All electrical wires must be inaccessible to goats.	The wording "and electric wires must be inaccessible to goats" has been added to 2.2.2	
R13	Suggested new standard: Goat farms must be equipped with appropriate kidding facilities, whether indoor or outdoor, and have access to kidding equipment such as artificial feeders and replacement milk.	Maintaining kidding areas and manual feeding using locally available equipment is already common practice in cashmere producing regions.	
R14	Suggested new standard: Goats must not be routinely tethered.	This risk is rare in cashmere producing regions, so has not been added.	
R15	2.2.4 Include in mandatory requirements. Change to: Bucks: 4m ² Bucklings: 1.8m ² Does: 1.8m ² Doelings: 1m ² Kids: 0.5m ²	The code of practice follows the ICCAW requirements, which were drafted on the basis of expert consensus. It is not included in the mandatory requirements because it may imply infrastructure investments by herders. Including it in the good practice requirements incentivizes them to do so.	
R16	ADD: Suggested new standard: Goats should be provided with an appropriate thermal environment that is not too hot or too cold.	This was in the ICCAW Requirements, but it is difficult to audit because temperature varies daily and through the year, so this suggestion has not been included.	
R17	ADD: Suggested new standard: Goats must have access to an outdoor area for exercise except for where climatic conditions would pose a risk to health and welfare.	This is addressed in 2.2.8 (where access to outdoor exercise areas is a potential risk to address in housed systems) and in 2.2.3 (where access to shelter is a potential risk in grazing systems).	

	Comment	Preliminary response	Comments
R18	2.2.5 Include in mandatory requirements.	This has been moved to the mandatory requirements (2.2.5 in the revised requirements)	
R19	2.2.6 Include in mandatory requirements.	This has been moved to the mandatory requirements (2.2.4 in the revised requirements)	
R20	2.2.7 Include in mandatory requirements.	This has been moved to the mandatory requirements (2.2.6 in the revised requirements)	
R21	2.2.11 Include in mandatory requirements. Change to: Goat farms must be equipped with isolation pen(s) for weak, disabled, injured and sick goats.	The suggested wording has been adopted in 2.2.11	
R22	2.2.12 Include in mandatory requirements.	While herders should take appropriate measures, whether these measures are effective (i.e. the outcome) may depend on other factors, so it is best to retain this criterion as a good practice requirement and support continual improvement through training	
R23	2.2.13 Include in mandatory requirements.	At this point, it would not be productive to impose additional investment requirements on herders, so retain this as a good practice requirement.	
R24	ADD Suggested new standard: Fully slatted floors should not be used in goat houses.	2.2.13 now reads "Fully slatted floors should not be used in goat houses, and slatted floors should not be used in kidding houses."	
R25	2.3.1 Include electric goads.	This wording has been added to 2.3.1	
R26	2.3.4 Include in mandatory requirements.	This has been moved to the mandatory requirements, and 2.3.5 now reads "Goats must only be kept in isolation during a period of quarantine when a goat first enters a farm; or when they are sick, injured or convalescing; or for other reasons to protect goats' welfare."	
R27	2.3.5 Include in mandatory requirements.	These requirements are significantly different from common practice on many farms in cashmere producing regions, so at the present stage we	

	Comment	Preliminary response	Comments
		retain this as an improvement criterion and will address compliance through training programmes.	
R28	2.3.6 Change to: Before mating, suitable breeding does should be selected from the herd, and sick or disabled does, does with poor maternal instincts , and does with low production performance should be removed.	The suggested wording has been adopted in 2.3.7	
R29	ADD Suggested new standard: Before being put with the does, bucks should be inspected to ensure good health.	This is already common practice in cashmere producing regions, so we have not added it as a new criterion	
R30	2.3.8 Change to: If a goat farm uses natural mating, the ratio of bucks to does should be 1:30~1:50, depending on the age of the buck.	This wording has been adopted in 2.3.9	
R31	2.3.9 Include in mandatory requirements. Change to: Artificial insemination should only be implemented by competent trained personnel. Transcervical and/or intrauterine (laparoscopic) artificial insemination must not be carried out.	2.3. 4 now reads "Transcervical and/or intrauterine (laparoscopic) artificial insemination (AI) and embryo transfer are not allowed, and artificial insemination must only be implemented by competent trained personnel."	
R32	2.3.10 Include in mandatory requirements. Change to: All kids must receive sufficient colostrum , whether by natural methods or manual assistance, within 24 hours of birth, with the first feed occurring within 2 hours of birth.	2.3.10 now reads "All kids must receive sufficient colostrum, whether by natural methods or manual assistance, within 24 hours of birth, with the first feed occurring within 2 hours of birth"	
	2.3.11 Change to: Lactation management measures should be formulated for kids so that kids that are unable to suckle sufficient milk are manually fed with an artificial teat and/or bucket.	In line with the SFA Standards Setting Procedures, the criterion specifies the outcome but not the methods used to achieve this outcome, so we have not taken up this suggestion	
R33	2.3.13 Separate into two mandatory requirements 1- Castration is only allowed to enable proper management and ensure the welfare of the goat. It must be performed as soon as possible after the maternal bond has formed and ideally within 1 week of age but not after 3 months of age. Castration must be	This criterion has been split into 2 criteria (2.3.13, 2.3.14). For castration, factors such as kidding season and climate may mean that the suggested timing of castration suggested is not appropriate. Therefore, we have not adopted the recommended age requirements. Promoting these good welfare	

	Comment	Preliminary response	Comments
	<p>carried out using methods that minimise pain and suffering, in suitable conditions and with post-operation observation and care.</p> <p>2- Disbudding and dehorning are surgical procedures and must not be carried out routinely. If required, they must be carried out by a veterinary surgeon with appropriate pain relief.</p>	practices will be addressed through training programmes, so we retain this as a good practice requirement.	
R34	Add Suggested new standard: Pain relief should be administered to goats undergoing castration.	This has been added in 2.3.13	
R35	2.3.14 Include in mandatory requirements: Goat farm technicians and keepers responsible for managing goats must have received training in husbandry before being given responsibility for the welfare of animals.	This suggestion is aspirational. The reality at present is that many technicians and keepers have not received animal welfare training. 2.3.14 incentivizes farms run by enterprises to do so.	
R36	2.4.2 Change to: Sick goats that do not respond to treatment or who may be subject to chronic suffering must be promptly euthanized.	The suggested wording has been adopted in 2.4.2	
R37	2.4.4 Include in mandatory requirements. Change to: Newly purchased goats must be quarantined for 30 days and only mixed with the herd once they are confirmed as disease free.	The suggested wording has been adopted in 2.4.6	
R38	2.4.5 Change to: Hoofs should be trimmed when necessary by a competent person to prevent lameness.	At present, there are no training or accreditation programmes to accredit competent people. This suggestion could be taken up at a future date.	
R39	2.4.6 Include in mandatory requirements.	Moved to mandatory requirements.	
R40	2.4.7 Include in mandatory requirements.	This criterion has been moved to 2.4.4 as a mandatory requirement	
R41	2.4.9 Include in mandatory requirements.	2.4.9 is applicable to farms run by enterprises as it is a reasonable expectation that they have a full-time veterinarian to meet goats' health needs. For smallholder farms it is excessive burden to require they pay the costs of veterinarian visits unless for the purpose of preventive or curative actions	
R42	2.4.10 Include in additional good practise applicable to all farms.	Literacy levels on many farms are not high, and very few herders have the habit to make written plans. Therefore, making this applicable to all farms	

	Comment	Preliminary response	Comments
		is likely to lead to low compliance with no effects on animal welfare.	
R43	2.4.11 Include in additional good practise applicable to all farms.	Literacy levels on many farms are not high, and very few herders have the habit to make written plans. Therefore, making this applicable to all farms is likely to lead to low compliance with no effects on animal welfare.	
R44	2.5.1 Change to: Cashmere fibre must only be harvested when the fibre begins to naturally shed. If the cashmere is not easily harvested release the goat immediately and retry in 3-5 days.	2.5.1 already specifies the outcome, and in line with SFA Standards Setting Procedure, specific methods to achieve the outcome are not described.	
R45	2.5.2 Change to: Goats may only be restrained by either a) tying a rope around two lateral legs or b) using a grooming stand. For a), the rope must not be tied too tightly, so as to avoid poor blood circulation or other injuries, and the rope must be untied as soon as possible after harvesting. For b) the head must not be held in an unnatural position and must not be held so tightly the goat starts to panic. For both methods the handling must be confident but calm and gentle.	This has been rewritten to: "If goats are restrained during fibre harvesting, Goats may only be restrained either a) by tying a rope around two lateral legs or b) using a grooming stand. For a), the rope must not be tied too tightly, so as to avoid poor blood circulation or other injuries, and the rope must be untied as soon as possible after harvesting. For b), the head must not be held in an unnatural position and must not be held so tightly the goat starts to panic. "	
R46	2.5.3 Change to: It is forbidden to bind three or four legs or for the operator to use their legs or feet to step on any part of the goat.	Wording revised as suggested	
R47	2.5.4 Include in mandatory requirements	This has been moved to the mandatory requirements	
R48	2.5.5 Include in mandatory requirements	Moved to mandatory requirements	
R49	2.5.6 Include in mandatory requirements. Change to: Fibre must only be harvested when the climate does not pose a health risk to goats. Harvesting must be suspended on days with rain, snow or other severe weather conditions.	This has been moved to the mandatory requirements with suggested wording	

	Comment	Preliminary response	Comments
R50	2.5.7 Include in mandatory requirements	This depends on weather, so was not made a mandatory requirement	
R51	2.5.8 Include in mandatory requirements. Change to: All tools used for shearing or combing cashmere fibre must be in a proper state for use: shearing equipment must be appropriate for use on goat fibre and in good working order, and combs must not be so sharp that they cause skin damage.	This has been moved to mandatory requirements and the wording "During the harvest season" added.	
R52	2.5.9 Include in mandatory requirements. Change to: The fibre harvesting operators must be trained in fibre harvesting skills and animal welfare related knowledge before they are responsible for harvesting.	This suggestion is aspirational. At present many harvesting operators have not received animal welfare training. 2.5.9 incentivizes farms run by enterprises to do so.	
R53	2.6.1 Change to: All goats must be fit for transport. Goats that are sick, injured, unable to stand unaided, does in the last 2 months of gestation or that otherwise are at risk during transport, must not be transported unless for veterinary treatment.	Suggested wording has been accepted	
R54	2.6.2 Change to: For journeys over 8 hours , goats must be provided with water, feed and rest, according to their needs.	Suggested wording has been accepted	
R55	2.6.3 Include in mandatory requirements	Given the difference with common practice, we retain this as a good practice requirement and relevant contents will be included in training programmes	
R56	2.6.4 Change to: During transport, goats should have enough space to stand up and lie down. This table shows the minimum space requirements. Does in the final 2 months of gestation, unless for emergency treatment. Buck: 0.5m ² Doe: 0.3m ² Pregnant Doe: 0.4m ² Yearling: 0.3m ²	The space allowances follow the ICCAW Requirements, which are the outcome of expert consultations. The restrictions on transport of does in the last 2 months of pregnancy is addressed in 2.6.1	
R57	2.6.5 Include in mandatory requirements	This depends on the weather so is not included in the mandatory requirements.	

	Comment	Preliminary response	Comments
R58	ADD Suggested new standard: Goats must be stunned before slaughter to ensure they are insensible to pain.	Given the rarity of this practice and limited availability of equipment for implementing this, the suggestion is aspirational. One important future component of the workplan in China will be to demonstrate and promote appropriate methods for achieving this in the conditions on farms in the region.	
R69	2.7.1 Change to: Goats must be promptly and humanely euthanized if they are experiencing pain or sickness and have no prospect of recovery.	2.7.1 reworded as suggested. 2.7.1 refers to euthanasia, 2.7.2 refers to all on-farm slaughter, so the two criterion have been kept separate.	
R70	2.7.2 Delete standard. Included in new standard above.		
R71	2.7.5 Include in mandatory requirements. Change to: Slaughter must only be conducted by: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a) trained and competent personnel who have also been trained in animal welfare and, b) have the required stunning/slaughter equipment that is fit for purpose. 	This is aspirational. An important future component of the workplan in China will be to demonstrate and promote appropriate methods for achieving this in the conditions on farms in the region.	
R72	2.7.6 Include in additional good practise requirements applicable to all farms.	Literacy levels on many farms are not high, and very few herders have the habit to make written records. Therefore, making this applicable to all farms is likely to lead to low compliance with no effects on animal welfare.	
B1	In the introduction the CoP states that, 'This Code of Practice sets out the requirements for welfare-friendly cashmere production on-farm. For further guidance on transport and slaughter off-farm, see ICCAW's 'Farm Animal Welfare Requirements – Cashmere Goat'. But later says, 'This section sets out the requirements for welfare-friendly cashmere goat husbandry in eight units: 1. Feeding and drinking water 2. The farming environment 3. Husbandry management 4. Health 5. Fibre harvesting 6. Transport and farm	Transport and slaughter refer to on-farm activities or activities under the control of the herder. It does not correspond exactly to the ICCAW requirements, because the CoP focuses on addressing the main risks to animal welfare in the on-farm transport context.	

	Comment	Preliminary response	Comments
	transfer 7. Humane slaughter 8. Farm inspection and auditing'. To confirm point 7. Refers to Human slaughter on farm only? Does the transport section completely match ICCAW's guidance?		
B2	2.1.8 – does this point need to be specific i.e. heights and trough space per goat? As per the metrics provided for housing/transport?	It is common practice to feed goats in cohorts, which enables space requirements to be managed by varying animal numbers. Considering also that it may not be productive to require investments in farm infrastructure, so the revised draft remains consistent with the ICCAW requirements, which do not specify space requirements beyond "goats can eat at the same time without crowding".	
B3	For the farming environment criteria – should some of the 'Good practice' requirements be mandatory? For all accredited farms (even at bronze level) it seems like space, bedding and air quality should be mandatory. It would be good to understand the reasoning behind these being good practice.	Criteria for bedding, air quality and light have been moved to the mandatory criteria. Space may require investment by herders so has not been moved to the mandatory criteria, but is set as an improvement criterion to be met over time, if not met at first assessment.	
B4	Could the language for 2.3.4 and 2.4.4 could be made more similar, they are making the same point?	2.3.4 sets mandatory limits on conditions for isolation, 2.4.4 specifies one situation in which isolation should be required, so we keep them separate.	
B5	For fibre harvesting. Currently the point about trained operators only applies to farms run by enterprises – should this be applicable to all farms? It seems inherently linked to the mandatory requirements and good practice requirements for all farms. It would be good to understand the reasoning behind the distinction being made	At present there is no programme to train fibre harvesters, so it is not a mandatory requirement. However, for companies it is possible for them to provide such training, while for smallholders it is not possible as there is no accessible source of training.	
B6	For transport, should a long distance journey be defined? Are there specific time intervals when goats should be provided with water, feed and rest?	Long has been defined as 8 hours but other specifics should be "according to animals' needs" as this will vary by season and other contextual factors.	

	Comment	Preliminary response	Comments
B7	2.7.5 – what is the scope of, ‘trained in animal welfare’? Is this just in relation to human slaughter or animal welfare as a whole?	We have added wording to clarify that this is training in animal welfare in relation to slaughter.	
B8	For inspecting and auditing farms – how long are the audits and how do farms not run by enterprises prove they are compliant with mandatory requirements?	The auditing requirements will be described in separate documents. In brief, self-assessments will be assessed by a third party, same for both companies and small farms.	

	企业反馈意见	建议的修改方法	备注
O1	强制性部分:我们观察到, 大多数强制性要求都是定性的, 只有一个(共 24 个)是定量的。您的"福利实践准则评估指南"是否提供了评估这些定性要求的数字或其他线索?	所有条款都能够用直接或间接指标评价是否符合。具体评价方法将在核查方指南中明确说明。	
O2	概述:我们理解, 要达到银级, 需要满足 50%的良好实践, 但没有指明是哪些良好实践。难道没有比一些要求更重要的要求吗? 再次, 也许您的"福利行为准则评估指南"提供了关于这一点的指导或建议?	在较短和较长的时间尺度上, 不同的农场根据不同的标准有不同的改进潜力。因此, 指南并不区分良好做法要求。达到其中任何方面的 50%就足以达到银级。	
O3	概述:是否期望在最短期内(例如 1 年或 2 年)从铜牌升至银牌?	第三部分中增加了: "第一次获得认证以后, 每个羊场应该每年在至少一项良好实践指标上有改进, 最终能获得金级认证。"	
O4	2.2.8 令我们惊讶的是, 没有发现要求持续进入室外区域的标准。是因为大部分的养殖系统都是完全的室内养殖吗? 难道不能把它作为一种好的做法吗? 还是包括在你所说的"运动区"?	2.2.8 英文中增加了'室外'但中文不需要调整。	
O5	第 2.6 节和第 2.7 节。我们发现屠宰和运输部门比其他方面少, 没有那么多量化的要求。不管是不是强制性的。是不是因为它很少发生在农场, 因此超出了本文档的范围? 这两个问题在动物福利方面相当敏感, 我们设想了更多的标准来确保这些做法。(运输示例:最大旅行距离或时间? 遮蔽阳光? 卡车的坡度和地板。屠宰的例子:对授权屠宰方法的限制?)	《指南》没有涉及农场外的运输和屠宰, 因为《指南》是用于农场认证的。不适用于运输商或屠宰场的认证。运输仅限于在农场转移期间运输或在牧民监控下为其他目的运输。这类运输的主要风险已经有所涉及。农场屠宰也是另一个关注点, 并将成为未来试验、示范和促进人道屠宰方法的工作重要。目前, 没有足够的依据来确定在羊群中切实可行的方法。关于适用范围限制在农场内, 前言、第二部分中各单元的名单以及 2.6 标题后面的备注中明确了'场内'。	

O6	概述:环境和土地管理不包括在这份文件中, 我们理解这份文件只关注动物福利。是否应在今后的指南中予以涵盖?	目前, 在中国的羊绒产区没有足够的证据来推荐具体草地管理实践。希望为了能够经过试验和示范确认具有积极经济效益的放牧管理方法, 并将其纳入今后对《指南》的修订。	
O7	概述:在可追溯性方面的如下问题: 纤维标识和隔离记录/文件管理 (例如, 收获的纤维数量、意外死亡、药物等)。	目前正在制定的 SFA 监管链准则将涉及可追溯性问题。	
L1	2.1. 喂养和饮水 适用于所有农场的良好做法要求 加入 - 应根据动物的生理状态 (怀孕、挤奶、产仔) 改变饮食管理	2.1.1 修改后为: “每只绒山羊必须能够获得与其生理需要相匹配的营养, 除非兽医专门建议了限制饮食。”	
L2	适用于所有农场的良好做法要求 加入 - 应使用身体状况评分来评估饮食计划的充分性, 并在必要时进行相应的调整	按照公认的评分系统进行膘情评分目前在内蒙古并不普遍。引入膘情评分计划和相关培训可以作为长期能力建设计划的一部分。	
L3	适用于所有农场的良好做法要求 加入 2.1.13-应记录饲料管理的变化	许多小型农场的识字率很低, 牧民没有记录生产实践的做法, 因此要求这样做可能会导致遵守程度很低, 而且不会给动物福利带来任何好处。	
L4	2.2. 农业环境-房屋建筑 强制性要求 添加 - 在本节中, 必须添加有关如何管理分娩和护理空间的说明 -	目前, 尚未确定与管理分娩和护理的空间有关的具体风险。随着农场审核数据的增多, 我们将继续对此风险进行审查。	

L5	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - 在本节中应介绍隔离和医务室两个空间的必要性，这两个空间应远离其他居住环境，并得到妥善管理。 	目前，这两种功能空间的缺失尚未被确定为一种常见的福利风险。不同功能区域之间的具体距离受土地权属等因素的影响，因此行为准则中未规定具体距离	
L6	<p>适用于所有农场的良好做法要求加入</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - 将动物系牢的设备及装置的建造及保养，须使其没有相当可能对动物造成伤害的锐边或突出物。 - 	这包括在现有要求 2.2.1 中。	
L7	2.2.12增加:.....和防止野生食肉动物的攻击	2.2.12 增加了与野生动物袭击相关的内容	
L8	2.2.14 2.2.15请提供所引用标准NY/T 682和NY/T 1168的文本	这些标准的文本将被翻译并作为补充材料提供	
L9	<p>适用于所有农场的良好做法要求 加入</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - 在每个农场，不同的建筑应该被清楚识别。对专门用于纤维收获和饲料储存的建筑物的要求将在文件的专门章节中分析。 - 	不清楚"清楚识别"是什么意思。如果这意味着有一个永久的牌匾，这是不必要的，因为所有人都知道在农场的建筑，缺乏一个牌匾本身并不妨碍动物福利。如果它的意思是"在审核访问期间向审核员确认"，则不需要写入指南。	
L10	<p>适用于所有农场的良好做法要求 加入</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - 必须确定足够的饲料原料储存设施，并将其放置在远离居住环境的地方，以避免饲料卸货时的污染。 	目前适用于所有农场的要求是 2.1.2，这与饲喂受污染饲料的风险有关。在现阶段，我们不希望将农场基础设施投资要求强加给生产者。然而，我们将继续审查相关风险。对于企业经营的养殖场，这一要求体现在相关标准的生物安全措施中。	

L11	<p>适用于所有农场的良好做法要求 加入</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> 可容纳作业车辆的设备应放置在农场范围内，但应远离生活环境，以避免因车轮不清洁而造成污染。 	<p>对于企业经营的养殖场，这一要求体现在相关标准的生物安全措施中。对于其他生产者，在现阶段我们不希望强加额外的农场基础设施投资要求。然而，我们将继续审查相关风险。</p>	
L12	<p>适用于所有农场的良好做法要求 加入</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> 当畜群包括许多动物时，应根据年龄和生理状况将动物分配在不同的组中，并尊重空间限度 	<p>这已经是中国羊绒产区的普遍做法，因此我们没有将其添加到《指南》中。关于空间的规定，2.2.5中已有规定</p>	
L13	<p>适用于所有农场的良好做法要求 加入</p> <p>除非根据兽医对传染性疾病的处方，否则不应隔离山羊</p>	<p>要求 2.3.4 确定了隔离山羊的更广泛的潜在原因：“当山羊首次进入农场时；或当它们生病、受伤或康复时；或出于保护山羊福利的其他原因”。这种更广泛的理由更好地涵盖了对个体动物福利的风险。</p>	
L14	<p>2.3. 畜牧管理</p> <p>强制性要求添加</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> 禁止使用腹腔镜人工授精方法以及用于生殖和采卵的胚胎移植。 	<p>2.3.9 变未必须的要求，而新的 2.3.4 规定了“禁止使用腹腔镜人工授精、子宫腔内人工授精以及胚胎移植技术”</p>	
L15	<p>强制性要求添加</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> 2.3.2添加.....并且每个农场都应该有一个健康登记簿 	<p>许多小农场的识字水平很低，牧民没有记录生产做法的做法（接种疫苗除外，由准兽医填写），因此要求这样做很可能导致遵守情况很差，对动物福利没有任何好处。</p>	
L16	<p>强制性要求添加</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> 2.3.4隔离必须远离居住环境 	<p>不同功能区域之间的具体距离受土地权属等因素的影响，因此行为准则中未规定具体距离。目前阶段不希望要求生产者增加投资。</p>	
L17	<p>适用于所有农场的良好做法要求 加入</p>	<p>乳腺炎是多种疾病当中的一种，不宜在行为准则中为所有病情提供具体措施，然而计划在培训中提供相关知识。</p>	

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - 如果会发生乳腺炎，则不能使用羊奶奶奶喂养小羊，并且必须正确丢弃 		
L18	<p>2.4. 健康 强制性要求添加</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - 强烈建议对动物健康数据进行登记，以了解动物个体和群体的健康和治疗状况。 	许多小型农场的识字率很低，牧民没有记录生产实践的做法，因此要求这样做可能会导致低的遵守率，而不会对动物福利产生影响。	
L19	<p>适用于所有农场的良好做法要求 加入</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - 2.4.5每年至少检查一次蹄部，并..... - 	2.4.7 改为“每年至少检查一次蹄部，并必要时应修蹄，预防跛足发生”	
L20	<p>适用于所有农场的良好做法要求 加入</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - 2.4.5增加:必须在农场提供治疗登记册 - 	许多小型农场的识字率很低，牧民没有记录生产实践的做法，因此要求这样做可能会导致低的遵守率，而不会对动物福利产生影响。	
L21	<p>适用于所有农场的良好做法要求</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - 2.4.7增加:.....并应登记 - 	添加了保留接种记录的要求。	
L22	<p>适用于所有农场的良好做法要求</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - 2.4.9必须指定一名负责动物健康和福利的兽医，且必须每年至少访问农场两次 	目前，羊绒产区的兽医没有动物福利方面的任务，也没有指导他们这方面工作的指南。这里的方法是提高所有从事山羊养殖的人的动物福利知识、技能和实践。2.4.9 条适用于企业经营的农场，因为它们有理由期望拥有一名专职兽医来满足山羊的健康需要。对小农户而言，除非是为了预防或治疗目的，否则要求他们支付兽医出诊费用的负担过重。	
L23	适用于企业经营的农场的其他良好做法要求 加入	这些标准的文本将被翻译并作为补充材料提供	

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - 2.4.10必须查阅所引用的标准，因为本文件完全没有生物安全。只是引用，但从来没有描述。 		
L24	<p>适用于企业经营的其他良好做法要求 加入</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - 添加:野生动物/杂草控制 <p>最大限度地减少野生动物和家养动物将疾病传入牲畜的可能性。</p>	<p>在上述标准的生物安全要求中涉及了尽量减少来自其他家畜的疾病的风险。目前没有证据表明野生动物或野生动物传播疾病的问题。可作为今后研究的课题。</p>	
L25	<p>2.5. 纤维采收</p> <p>适用于所有农场的良好做法要求 加入</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - 剪毛后，如果天气寒冷且有风，山羊必须关在室内，保持干燥，并适当喂养（使用良好的原料）至少2-3天。 	<p>2.5.8 为“取绒后若遇天气变冷，应采取措施避免羊只受寒”，即明确了生产者需要达到的结果但没有规定具体措施，这样符合了《SFA 标准制定程序》</p>	
L26	<p>适用于所有农场的良好做法要求 加入</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - 收获棚区应在物理和视觉上与休息区分开 	<p>在现阶段，我们不希望对生产商施加额外的基础设施投资要求。</p>	
L27	<p>适用于所有农场的良好做法要求 加入</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - 在开始采收之前，必须确保上述卫生规则。所有山羊必须在至少12小时之前不能获得食物和水，并且必须根据预先确定的类别（年龄、性别等）将它们送到采收地点。 	<p>分类型取绒已经是普遍做法。增加了关于禁食的要求，但采取了 ICCAW《要求》中的具体要求因为是专家咨询的结果。</p>	
L28	<p>在第2.5.8点下，请增加以下要求:</p> <p>"在剪绒和梳绒过程中，羊绒纤维应放入尼龙纤维袋中，避免沾污，不应使用聚丙烯纤维袋。"</p>	<p>袋子往往由商家提供，改善袋子需要生产链中的合作，因此不宜在羊场认证行为准则中提要求。</p>	

L29	<p>2.6. 运输</p> <p>强制性要求添加</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - 在运输过程中，公羊和母羊、成羊和小羊必须分开 	这已经是常见的做法。	
L30	<p>适用于所有农场的良好做法要求 加入</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - 运输过程中需要适当通风 - 	运输过程中通风不足未被确定为牧民运输过程中的风险。然而，在进一步调查交通福利问题时，将关注这一点。	
L31	<p>适用于所有农场的良好做法要求 加入</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - 装卸设施的设计、建造、保养和操作均足以避免动物受伤和遭受痛苦，并确保动物的安全 	新增加了 2.6.3：“车辆以及装卸设施的设计、建造、保养和操作均必须足以避免动物受伤和遭受痛苦，并确保山羊在运输过程中的安全。”	
L32	<p>适用于所有农场的良好做法要求 加入</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - 为动物提供了足够的地板面积和高度，与它们的大小和计划的旅程相适应； 	这包括在现有的 2.6.4 中，它定义了能够站立的地板空间要求和足够的高度。	
L33	<p>适用于所有农场的良好做法要求 加入</p> <p>应特别注意避免伤害动物，使用安全光滑的配件，没有尖锐的突出物。</p>	新增加了 2.6.3：“车辆以及装卸设施的设计、建造、保养和操作均必须足以避免动物受伤和遭受痛苦，并确保山羊在运输过程中的安全。”	
L34	<p>2.7. 人道屠杀</p> <p>适用于所有农场的良好做法要求 加入</p> <p>2.7.4 如用于食品，屠宰前应严格遵守休药期的有关规定</p>	2.7.4 中增加了相关词语	

R1	<u>2.1.1 更改为:山羊必须获得充足的营养, 适合每只动物每天的需要和生产状态, 除非由适当的合格人员指定限制饮食。</u>	2.1.1 改为“每只绒山羊必须能够获得与其生理需要相匹配的营养, 除非兽医专门建议了限制饮食。”	
R2	<u>2.1.2 建议的新标准:由于缠绕风险, 不得使用干草网喂养有角山羊。</u>	牧区使用干草网为被认定作为普遍的风险	
R3	<u>2.1.5 更改为:山羊 (包括羔羊) 每天必须获得充足、清洁和新鲜的饮用水, 除非有合适的合格人员要求不能获得。</u>	2.1.8 改为“保证绒山羊 (包括羔羊) 能够饮用充足、清洁、新鲜的水, 至少每天一次, 除非兽医专门建议了限制饮水。”	
R4	<u>补充:建议的新标准:山羊 (包括小山羊) 应能持续获得充足、清洁和新鲜的饮用水, 除非有适当的合格人员要求不能获得。</u>	这将是一种愿望, 但目前在主要生产区的许多农场并不可行, 因为水源类型以及羊场与放牧地点之间的距离。	
R5	<u>2.1.6 纳入强制性要求</u>	主要是舍饲圈养条件下的风险, 已移到必须的要求中。	
R6	<u>2.1.8 更改为:当使用饲料槽时, 所有山羊应能同时采食, 并提供以下最小饲料空间许可:</u> 小山羊:每头 40 厘米 大型山羊:每头 50 厘米 这些要求是最低要求, 应根据个人情况增加。	分类型喂养是普遍做法, 并且让牧民能够通过调整采食羊的数量来避免拥挤, 而且考虑不希望要求增加投资, 因此与 ICCAW 《要求》一致, 没有提出具体空间要求。	
R7	<u>2.1.9 包括在强制性要求中。改变为:饲养设备必须保持清洁和维护, 在动物被允许使用设备之前, 必须修复任何损坏。</u>	已改为必须的要求 (修改后的 2.1.3)	
R8	<u>2.1.10 纳入强制性要求</u>	本条款适用于放牧和半舍饲系统, 并作为附加条款增加到 2.1.1 中。	
R9	<u>2.1.11 包括在强制性要求中</u>	已移动到必须的条款中 (2.1.7)	
R10	<u>增加建议的新标准:在室内饲养的山羊应该有机会表现出自然的觅食行为。</u>	增加了 2.1.1 1: “若采用舍饲生产系统, 绒山羊应该有机会表现其自然的采食行为 (如随高就低采食、不同食物间选择等)。”	

R11	<u>2.2 增加建议的新标准:在居住时, 必须有一段时间的低水平照明, 以促进休息行为。</u>	新的要求 2.1.1 2 为: 若采用舍饲生产系统, <u>必须每天</u> 有一段时间的低水平照明, 以促进休息行为。	
R12	建议的新标准:所有电线必须是山羊无法接近的。	相关词语已增加到 2.2.2 中	
R13	建议的新标准:山羊养殖场必须配备适当的饲养设施, 无论是室内还是室外, 并可使用人工喂养器和替代牛奶等饲养设备。	配备下羔空间以及采用当地材料进行人工喂养已经是普遍做法,	
R14	建议的新标准:山羊不能被常规拴住。	牧区里相关风险较低, 因此未采纳此建议。	
R15	<u>2.2.4 纳入强制性要求。更改为:</u> 公羊:4 平方米 小公羊 :1.8 平方米 母羊:1.8 平方米 小母羊:1 平方米 小羊:0.5 平方米	具体空间标准是根据在专家共识基础上起草的 ICCAW 《要求》。它不包括在强制性要求中, 因为它可能意味着牧民的基础设施投资。将其纳入良好做法要求会激励他们提供足够的空间。	
R16	<u>加入:建议新标准:应为山羊提供适当的热环境, 既不太热也不太冷。</u>	这本来是 ICCAW 标准中的, 但由于气温由每日和随着季节的变化, 所以很难审核, 因此未被列入。	
R17	<u>加入:建议的新标准:山羊必须能够进入户外区域进行运动, 除非气候条件会对健康和福利造成风险。</u>	这一点在第 2.2.8 节 (进入户外运动区是有舍饲系统中需要解决的潜在风险) 和第 2.2.3 节 (进入遮蔽处是放牧系统中的潜在风险) 中有涉及。	
R18	<u>2.2.5 包括在强制性要求中。</u>	已移动到必须的条款中 (2.2.5)	
R19	<u>2.2.6 包括在强制性要求中。</u>	已移动到必须的条款中 (2.2.4)	
R20	<u>2.2.7 包括在强制性要求中。</u>	已移动到必须的条款中 (2.2.6)	
R21	<u>2.2.11 包括在强制性要求中。改为:羊场必须为弱、残、伤、病山羊设置隔离栏。</u>	2.2.1 1 中增加了相关词语	
R22	<u>2.2.12 包括在强制性要求中。</u>	牧民应该采取措施, 但这些措施是否有效可能取决于其他因素, 因此我们建议最好将其作为良好实践要求保留, 并通过培训支持持续改进	
R23	<u>2.2.13 包括在强制性要求中。</u>	现阶段, 我们不希望对牧民提出额外的投资要求, 保留作为良好实践。	

R24	<u>加入 建议的新标准:全板条地板不应在羊舍中使用。</u>	2.2.13 改为:“羊舍中不应该使用全板条地板且羔舍不宜使用板条地板。”	
R25	<u>2.3.1 包括电棒。</u>	2.3.1 中增加了“电棒”	
R26	<u>2.3.4 包括在强制性要求中。</u>	已移动到必须的条款中, 并 2.3.5 改为“只应该在以下几种情况对羊只施行单独隔离: 新入群的养殖隔离期间; 患病、受伤或正在康复的羊只; 或其它为了保证羊只福利的原因。”	
R27	<u>2.3.5 包括在强制性要求中。</u>	此要求与普遍实践差异较大, 因此现阶段作为良好实践条款并将通过培训支持持续改进。	
R28	<u>2.3.6 改为:配种前, 应从群中选择合适的繁育母羊, 淘汰病残、母性差、生产性能低的母羊。</u>	英文版本 2.3.7 中采纳了建议的编辑, 中文意思不变。	
R29	<u>加入 建议的新标准:在与母羊一起放置前, 应检查公羊, 以确保身体健康。</u>	此建议已经是普遍实践, 未列入文本中。	
R30	<u>2.3.8 更改为:如果山羊养殖场采用自然交配, 公羊与母羊的比例应为 1:30~1:50, 具体取决于公羊的年龄。</u>	2.3.9 中接收了此建议。	
R31	<u>2.3.9 包括在强制性要求中。更改为:人工授精只能由经过培训的合格人员实施。不得进行经宫颈和/或宫内(腹腔镜)人工授精。</u>	2.3.4 改为:“禁止使用腹腔镜人工授精、子宫腔内人工授精以及胚胎移植技术, 若采取其它人工授精方法配种, 操作的人员应是技术熟练、经过培训的人。”	
R32	<u>2.3.10 包括在强制性要求中。更改为:所有小羊必须在出生后 24 小时内获得足够的初乳, 无论是通过自然方法还是人工辅助, 第一次喂养在出生后 2 小时内进行。</u>	2.3.10 改为“所有羊羔必须在出生后 24 小时内获得足够的初乳, 无论是通过自然方法还是人工辅助, 且第一次喂养在出生后 2 小时内进行。”	
	<u>2.3.11</u> 更改为:应为小羊制定哺乳管理措施, 以便无法吮吸足够乳汁的小羊用人工奶嘴和/或奶桶人工喂养。	根《SFA 标准制定程序》, 此条款明确了生产者需要得到的结果但未规定具体的措施。	
R33	<u>2.3.13 分为两个强制性要求</u>	根据此建议, 已把这一条分为两个条款 (2.3.13, 2.3.14)。关于阉割的年龄, 由于季节和气候条件等因	

	<p>1- 只是为进行适当的管理，并确保山羊的福利的情况下允许阉割。必须在与母羊的联系形成后尽快进行，理想的是在 1 周龄内，而不是 3 个月龄后。阉割必须在适当的条件下，并在手术后观察和护理下，采用最大限度减少疼痛和痛苦的方法进行。</p> <p>2-去芽和去角是外科手术，不得常规进行。如果需要，他们必须由兽医进行适当的疼痛缓解。</p>	<p>素，不能确定所建议的年龄为正确，因此未采纳关于年龄的建议。继续保留作为良好实践，为了通过培训持续改进。</p>	
R34	<u>加入 建议的新标准:应对接受阉割的山羊施用止痛药。</u>	2.3.13 中添加了关于止疼措施。	
R35	<u>2.3.14 纳入强制性要求:山羊饲养场技术人员和负责管理山羊的饲养员必须接受过饲养方面的培训，然后才能负责动物的福利。</u>	这个建议是希望达到的，但目前的现实是，很多技术人员和饲养员没有接受过动物福利培训。2.3.14 鼓励企业经营的农场提供培训。	
R36	<u>2.4.2 更改为:对治疗无效或可能遭受慢性痛苦的病羊必须立即实施安乐死。</u>	2.4.2 中采纳了此建议	
R37	<u>2.4.4 包括在强制性要求中。更改为:新购买的山羊必须经过 30 天的检疫，只有在确认无病的情况下才能与羊群混合。</u>	2.4.6 中采纳了此建议	
R38	<u>2.4.5 更改为:必要时，应由有能力的人修剪蹄子，以防止跛行。</u>	目前，没有全面的培训方案来认证有能力的人。这一建议可在今后接受。	
R39	<u>2.4.6 包括在强制性要求中。</u>	移动到必须的要求中	
R40	<u>2.4.7 包括在强制性要求中。</u>	此条款已移动到 2.4.4 作为必须的要求	
R41	<u>2.4.9 包括在强制性要求中。</u>	2.4.9 适用于企业经营的农场，因为有理由期望企业拥有一名专职兽医来满足山羊的健康需求。对小农户来说，除非是为了预防或治疗，否则要求他们支付兽医的出诊费是一种过重的负担。	
R42	<u>2.4.10 包括在适用于所有农场的额外良好做法。</u>	许多农场的识字水平不高，很少有牧民有制定书面计划的习惯。因此，使其适用于所有农场很可能会导致低遵从性，对动物福利没有影响。	

R43	<u>2.4.11 包括在适用于所有农场的额外良好做法。</u>	许多农场的识字水平不高，很少有牧民有制定书面计划的习惯。因此，使其适用于所有农场很可能会导致低遵从性，对动物福利没有影响。	
R44	<u>2.5.1 更改为:只有当纤维开始自然脱落时，才能收获羊绒纤维。如果不容易收获羊绒，立即释放山羊，并在3-5天后重试。</u>	2.5.1 已明确了结果，与《SFA 标准制定程序》吻合，未规定具体措施。	
R45	<u>2.5.2 更改为:山羊只能通过 a) 在两侧腿上系一根绳子或 B) 使用梳理架进行约束。</u> 对于 a) 绳子不能绑得太紧，以免造成血液循环不畅或其他伤害，收获后必须尽快解开绳子。 对于 B) 头不能以不自然的姿势约束，也不能约束得太紧以至于山羊开始惊慌。 对于这两种方法，处置必须是自信的，但冷静而温和。	已修改为：“取绒时，可采用两种方式对羊进行适当保定：（1）在两侧推上系绳子或（2）使用梳理架。使用绳子时，不得系得过紧，以免造成血液循环不通畅或其它伤害，且必须尽量减少保定时间。使用架子时，头不能以不自然的姿势约束，也不能约束得太紧以至于山羊惊慌。”	
R46	<u>2.5.3 改为:禁止绑三条腿或四条腿，禁止操作者用腿或脚踩山羊的任何部位。</u>	接受了此建议	
R47	<u>2.5.4 纳入强制性要求</u>	已移动到必须的条款中。	
R48	<u>2.5.5 纳入强制性要求</u>	已移动到必须的条款中。	
R49	<u>2.5.6 包括在强制性要求中。改为:只有在气候不会对山羊的健康构成风险的情况下，才能收获纤维。在有雨、雪或其他恶劣天气条件的日子，必须暂停收货纤维。</u>	已移动到必须的条款中并接受了建议的语言	
R50	<u>2.5.7 纳入强制性要求</u>	这取决于天气，所以不是强制性要求	
R51	<u>2.5.8 包括在强制性要求中。更改为:用于剪绒或梳绒的所有工具必须处于适当的使用状态:剪绒设备必须适合在山羊纤维上使用并处于良好的工作状态，梳子不能太锋利而导致皮肤损伤。</u>	已移动到必须的要求中并加了“取绒季节 . . . ”	

R52	<u>2.5.9 包括在强制性要求中。更改为:取绒操作员在负责取绒之前必须接受取绒技能和动物福利相关知识的培训。</u>	希望能够达到这样的结果,但目前的实际情况是,许多取绒操作人员没有接受过动物福利培训。2.5.9 鼓励企业经营的农场这样做。	
R53	<u>2.6.1 更改为:所有山羊必须适合运输。患病、受伤、不能独立站立、在妊娠最后 2 个月期间或在运输过程中有其它危险的山羊,除非是进行兽医治疗,否则不得运输。</u>	接受了建议的语言编辑	
R54	<u>2.6.2 更改为:对于超过 8 小时的行程,必须根据山羊的需要为其提供水、饲料和休息。</u>	接受了建议的语言编辑	
R55	<u>2.6.3 包括在强制性要求中</u>	考虑此建议与普遍做法的差异,继续保留为良好实践并将通过培训持续改进	
R56	<u>2.6.4 改为:在运输过程中,山羊应有足够的空间站立和躺下。此表显示了最小空间要求。除非是进行紧急治疗,在妊娠的最后 2 个月的母羊。</u> 公羊:0.5m ² 母羊:0.3m ² 怀孕母羊:0.4m ² 周岁羊:0.3m ²	空间规定遵循 ICCAW 的《要求》,这是专家协商的结果。关于妊娠期最后两个月部分已纳入 2.6.1	
R57	<u>2.6.5 纳入强制性要求</u>	这取决于天气,所以不包括在强制性要求。	
R58	<u>加入 建议的新标准:山羊在屠宰前必须被击昏,以确保它们对疼痛没有感觉。</u>	由于这样的实践以及相关设备在牧区极少见,所以这是未来的一个重要目标。中国工作计划未来的一个重要组成部分将是示范和推广在该地区农场条件下实现这一目标的适当方法。	
R69	<u>2.7.1 更改为:如果山羊正在遭受疼痛或疾病,并且没有康复的希望,必须立即人道地对其实施安乐死。</u>	2.7.1 中接受了建议的语言。2.7.1 涉及安乐死而 2.7.2 涉及所以场内屠宰,因此继续保留两个条款。	
R70	<u>2.7.2 删除标准。包括在上述新标准中。</u>		

R71	2.7.5 包括在强制性要求中。更改为:屠宰必须由以下人员进行: a) 受过动物福利培训的合格人员, b) 配备所需的适合用途的击晕/屠宰设备。	这些要求与普遍情况差异较大但这是希望达到的结果。中国工作计划未来的一个重要组成部分将是示范和推广在该地区农场条件下实现这一目标的适当方法。	
R72	2.7.6 包括适用于所有农场的额外良好做法要求。	许多农场的识字水平不高,很少有牧民有做书面记录的习惯。因此,使其适用于所有农场很可能导致低遵从性,对动物福利没有影响。	
B1	前言提到了“运输和屠宰”,能否明确屠宰只是场内屠宰? 运输部分是否完全与 ICCAW 要求一样?	行为准则中运输和屠宰内容只适用于牧民控制的相关内容。运输内容符合 ICCAW 《要求》但没有那么全,因为行为准则集中针对场内运输的主要风险。	
B2	<u>2.1.8: 是否需要明确饲槽长短等?</u>	分类型喂食是普遍做法,通过调整羊数量来避免拥挤,同事考虑不希望 增加牧民投资的需要,因此行为准则文本保持与《要求》一致,未规定具体空间要求。	
B3	建议所有牧场都应该能够达到空间、垫料和空气质量要求	关于垫料、空气质量和照明条件都纳入了必须的要求。空间要求可能会涉及牧民的基础设施投资,因此现阶段作为良好实践。	
B4	建议合并 2.3.4 和 2.4.4	2.3.4 限制了隔离的理由,而 2.4.4 明确了一种理由因此继续保留两个条款	
B5	取绒培训只是针对企业员工,是否应该针对所有羊场?	目前,取绒培训课程不存在,因此没有作为必须的要求,而且虽然企业可以雇人提供培训,小牧户没有这个条件	
B6	<u>长距离运输有没有具体定义?</u>	长距离明确为 8 小时,其它根据山羊的具体需要,因为季节、气候等因素不同,其需要将是不同的。	
B7	<u>2.7.5 动物福利培训的范畴是什么?</u>	已明确了,该范畴为与屠宰相关的动物福利知识和技能	

B8	<u>关于农场核查，小农户如何证明符合了这些要求？</u>	关于农场评价的要求将在其它文件中描述。主要是牧民自我申报后，第三方核查，企业和牧户都一样	
----	-------------------------------	--	--